



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

where they were associated with Witchitas, Towakenoes, Caddos, Kichai, and Waco, all Pawnee tribes, and thus opportunity was afforded for unlimited borrowing.

The relationship of the Lipan to the Pawnee has been affirmed before, as Dunbar noted (p. 219), and for a very curious reason. An old spelling of the name is Lee-panes. The first syllable *Lee-* has been erroneously assumed to be the French particle *Le*, and so translated, The *Panes* or *Pawnees*. In point of fact the Lipan are a branch of the Apaches and speak an Apache dialect, which in turn belongs to the great Athapaskan or Tinné family of languages of British America. If, as the author probably correctly states, the Pawnees and their congeners originally came from the south, the Apache and Lipan, with the same or greater certainty, originated in the far north, and the only bond of kinship between the two peoples is that common to all Indian tribes wherever found.

The value of the book does not depend upon such details as these and should not be judged by them. Altogether the volume may be commended both to the student and the general reader as one of the very best of its class. Scattered through it are cuts of characteristic Pawnee faces, costumes, and implements, which add to its attractive appearance and are in keeping with the generally excellent make-up of the book.

H. W. HENSHAW.

Bibliography of the Muskhogean Languages by James Constantine Pilling. Washington: Government Printing Office. 1889. (Bulletin of the U. S. Bureau of Ethnology.)

The interest in American linguistics here and abroad is evidently increasing, and the number of scholars in the country at present engaged in the study of Indian languages, though even now not large, is a constantly growing one; ere long the subject will receive the attention it deserves. It is to be remarked, however, that as the number of students increase opportunities to collect material are diminishing, and with ever increasing rapidity. As the Indians die out, opportunities for original investigation die with them, and thus it appears that the duty of the hour for linguistic students is to accumulate and preserve the vanishing material rather than to elaborate study it. While the labors of Mr. Pilling concern the discovery and record of the linguistic material already gathered, they

have a distinct and important value, since they not only record the titles of books and tell where they may be consulted, but they furnish a comparative view of what has been done and of what remains to do to perfect the material for study in each group of languages. The fourth instalment of Mr. Pilling's work is now at hand in the "Bibliography of the Muskhogean Languages." The author's original plan contemplated a large volume, to include the whole subject of Indian bibliography, and in fact proof-sheets of this were printed and distributed among a small number of students. The present method of a separate bibliography for each linguistic stock is a great improvement, for as the studies of each student are generally confined to the languages and dialects of one family, the present plan brings within handy compass just the material needed by each one, and no more. Though based upon the material accumulated under the earlier plan of a single volume, the present Muskhogean bibliography is much more full than its predecessor, as it embodies the results of the compiler's later extensive researches, both at home and abroad, in public and private libraries. All the entries are under one alphabetic arrangement, a plan at once so simple and convenient that no one can fail to find what he is in search of or to learn just what material is available for study. To the latter end the plan adopted of cross-reference from the tribes to the matter published in the particular dialect, and to the authors, is an admirable one.

The fifth instalment is to be the Algonquian family—the most fruitful in material of all—and this is already far advanced toward completion. Altogether, linguistic scholars are greatly indebted to Mr. Pilling for the energy and thoroughness with which he has prosecuted his researches and for the admirable way in which they are presented, and to the Bureau of Ethnology under whose auspices the work has been prosecuted.

F. A. SEELY.